Supports for Knowledge

Part 2 of the 2022 Symposia on “Structured Knowledge” with a Pair of Spring and Autumn Symposia

Returning after 2020 to our tradition of Program Booklets, we present this Booklet with the Symposium Program, Abstracts, and Illustrations in thanks for generous contributions by presenters, organizers, sponsors, collectors, and owners of images.

In 2022, the Research Group returns to our series of Symposia (formerly held in person). The series underwent interruption from 2020, although the Program Booklet for the 2020 Spring Symposium was published as a record, souvenir, and statement of both intention and promise.

Resuming our tradition of Symposia, albeit so far online, the pair of Symposia in 2022 presents new, on-going, and cumulative work, including some presentations by speakers from the 2020 Symposium, with revived, updated, or new material. Examples include the reports for the database of the Index of Medieval Art and from research on a type of image in the BASIRA (“Books as Symbols in Renaissance Art”) Project.

This Autumn Symposium presents reports of discoveries, work-in-progress, and collaborative projects. Subjects include approaches to examining, cataloguing, and describing manuscripts and other forms of books and written records — or combinations thereof, as in the challenging categories of “Hybrid Books” — and various teaching and learning experiences with manuscripts and related materials.

We consider evidence from the medieval to modern periods and across a wide geographical, historical, and cultural range, both Western (European and North American) and non-Western. From multiple centers, the Symposium gathers specialists, teachers, students, collectors, and others engaged or interested in activities relating to manuscripts, printed books, other media, and mixtures of them.

Figure 1. Private Collection, MS 1, Folio ‘130’ recto, with color guide and scale. Perhaps Italy or Spain, fourteenth or fifteenth century. Part of the Latin Vulgate Psalms in the Septuagint Translation: Psalm 83:11 – 84:12 (Veri-.) from a large-format Latin Breviary in Gothic Script. Photography by Mildred Budny.
Program

SESSION 9:00–10:30 am EDT

Opening Remarks

Mildred Budny (Director, Research Group on Manuscript Evidence)

Session 1. Teaching With (and Through) Manuscripts

Presider: David Porreca (Department of Classical Studies, University of Waterloo)

Caley McCarthy (Research Associate and Project Manager, Environments of Change, University of Waterloo) and Andrew Moore (Research Fellow, Environments of Change, and Associate Director, DRAGEN Lab, University of Waterloo)

“Collaborative Pedagogy with Medieval Manuscripts in a Digital Lab”

William H. Campbell (Visiting Assistant Professor of History and Digital Studies and Director, Center for the Digital Text, University of Pittsburgh-Greensburg) and Amber McAlister (Assistant Professor, History & Architecture, University of Pittsburgh-Greensburg) and Connor Chinoy (University of Pittsburgh-Greensburg and student in the “History of the Book” class)

“Books in the Flesh: An Interdisciplinary Undergraduate Class with Medieval Manuscripts”

Coffee Break 10:30–10:45 am

SESSION 10:30 am–12:15 pm

Session 2. Catalogs, Metadata, and Databases, Continued (Part III)

Presider: Jessica L. Savage (Art History Specialist, Index of Medieval Art, Princeton University)

Moderator for the Questions-and-Answers: Derek Shank (Research Group on Manuscript Evidence)

Jessica L. Savage

“Cataloguing Manuscript Iconography between Digital Covers at the Index of Medieval Art”

Barbara Williams Ellerton (The BASIRA (“Books as Symbols in Renaissance Art”) Project and Research Group on Manuscript Evidence)

“A Painter, a Printer, and a Search for Shared Exemplars”

Katharine C. Chandler (Special Collections and Serials Cataloger, University of Arkansas Libraries)

“Manuscripts from Print: The Schwenkfelders and their Dangerous Books”

Responder: David Porreca (Department of Classical Studies, University of Waterloo)

“Response: My $0.02 Worth”
Lunch Break 12:15–1:15 pm

Within the Break:
Lunch-Time Presentation (TBD; if the Speaker can attend) 12:30–12:50 pm

Presider: Mildred Budny

David W. Sorenson (Allen Berman, Numismatist)

Session 1:15–2:45 pm

Session 3. The Living Library (Part II)

Presider: Jaclyn Reed (Department of English and Writing Studies, University of Western Ontario)

Christine E. Bachman (Department of Art & Art History, University of Colorado at Boulder)
“Unbound, Dispersed, Resewn: The Flexible Codex in Eighth-Century Northwestern Europe”

Zoey Kambour (Post Graduate Fellow in European & American Art at the Jordan Schnitzer Museum of Art at the University of Oregon)
“Textual Interaction Through Artistic Expression: The Marginal Drawings in the Decretales Libri V of Pope Gregory IX (University of Oregon MS 027)”

David Porreca (Department of Classical Studies, University of Waterloo)
“The Warburg Institute Library: Where Idiosyncracy Meets User-Friendliness”

Responder: Thomas E. Hill (Art Librarian, Vassar College)
“Some Early Background to Warburg’s Project in Post-Wunderkammer Systematic Catalogues of the European Baroque and Enlightenment Periods”
Tea Break 2:45–3:00 pm

Session 3:00–4:30 pm

Session 4. Hybrid Books (Part I)

Presider: Justin Hastings (University of Delaware)

Hannah Goeselt (Library and Information Science (MS): Cultural Heritage Informatics, Simmons University)
“Structures of Art and Scripture in Otto Ege’s ‘Cambridge Bible’ (Ege Manuscript 6)”

Jennifer Larson (Department of Classics, Kent State University)
“Printed and Scribed: A Collector’s View of Hybrid Books”

Linde M. Brocato (Cataloging & Metadata Librarian, University of Miami Libraries)
“Paths of Access and Horizons of Expectation, II: From Book-in-Hand to Catalog(ue)s”

Responder: N. Kıvılcım Yavuz (Lecturer in Medieval Studies and Digital Humanities, School of History, University of Leeds)
“Bound With: Towards a Typology of Hybrid Codices”

Break 4:30–4:45 pm

Session 4:45–5:30 pm

Session 5. Books and Their Structures

Presider: Mildred Budny

Closing Keynote Presentation

Linde M. Brocato
“Hybrid Books: Fragments and Compilatio, Structure and Heuristic in Richard Twiss’ Farrago”

Closing Remarks

Mildred Budny
“Structured Knowledge, Structures of Knowledge, and Supports for Knowledge: A Framework for the Year”
Figures 2-6. Ragyndrudis Codex, made and bound in the eighth century. Fulda, Hochschul- und Landesbibliothek, Codex Bonifatianus 2 (Ragyndrudis Codex), a religious compilation of texts by Pope Leo I, Ambrosius Autpertus, Isidore of Seville, and others, now kept in the Cathedral Treasury at Fulda. According to long tradition, the book was owned by the Anglo-Saxon missionary Saint Boniface (circa 675 – 754), and held by him at the time of his martyrdom. Vertical slashes through the leaves at top and bottom may derive from that attack. Images Public Domain from Bamberger Schätze via Creative Commons

Figure 2. Folio 2 verso. Title page with title enclosed in ornamented architectural arcade. Image via https://fuldig.hs-fulda.de/viewer/limage/PPN438486781/6/.
Abstracts (Alphabetical order by Speaker)

Bachman, Christine E. (Department of Art & Art History, University of Colorado at Boulder)
“Unbound, Dispersed, Resewn: The Flexible Codex in Eighth-Century Northwestern Europe”

The flexible nature of book structures in northwestern Europe in the eighth century is indicated by the increasing evidence that gatherings were kept loosely, at least for a period of time, and then placed unattached or loosely attached into a cover for storage or transportation. This paper presents a new analysis of that evidence in order to show the variety and ingenuity of book structures in this period of experimentation and the role of book structures in how readers engaged with the contents of books.

The evidence includes, for example,

- the cover of the Faddan More Psalter (Dublin, National Museum of Ireland)
  https://www.museum.ie/en-IE/Collections-Research/Irish-Antiquities-Division-Collections/Collections-List-(1)/Early-Medieval/The-Faddan-More-Psalter,

- the highly decorative quire marks in the Ragyndrudis Codex (Fulda, Landesbibliothek, Codex Bonifatianus 2)
  https://iiif.biblissima.fr/collections/manifest/b28f305b2735745d2636293e26a90e60d89aafd4?rify={%22view%22:%22info%22}, and

- an eighth-century limp binding used to encase a collection of texts by Isidore of Seville (Basel, Universitätsbibliothek, MS F III 15d)
  https://www.e-codices.unifr.ch/en/list/one/ubb/F-III-0015b).

Some reasons for choosing to not bind the pages of manuscripts were, undoubtedly, practical. Keeping the pages as loose gatherings allowed them to be distributed among a group of artists or scribes for copying. It was also less costly and time-consuming to eliminate the step of sewing the pages into a binding. However, keeping pages unbound or loosely bound would have also invited active learning and creativity. Pages could be rearranged, set side by side, or circulated among several students for a more dynamic reading experience. In this way, the flexible structure of the physical book played an essential role in structuring knowledge in the early middle ages.

[Figures 2–6]

Brocato, Linde M. (Cataloging & Metadata Librarian, University of Miami Libraries)
“Paths of Access and Horizons of Expectation, II: From Book-In-Hand to Catalog(ues)”

I will demonstrate with some of Jennifer Larson’s books how “hybrid” can be cataloged under current models and technologies of cataloging. Cases are the copies of the Comedies of Plautus (Frankfurt, 1604); and the Rule of Saint Benedict of Nursia and The Imitation of Christ for the Use of the Cistercian Order (Paris, 1686). I will also address the different kinds of catalog(ues) that provide different levels and kinds of access to materials, and the kinds of bibliographic structures that allow us to access materials.

[Figures 43–44 and 54–59]

Figure 3. Folio 54 verso. Image via https://fuldig.hs-fulda.de/viewer/object/PPN438486781/110/.
Figure 4. Folio 46 verso. Image via https://fuldig.hs-fulda.de/viewer/object/PPN438486781/94/.
Figure 5. Folio 22 verso. Image via https://fuldig.hs-fulda.de/viewer/object/PPN438486781/46/.
Figure 6. Bamberg, Staatsbibliothek, MS Misc. Lit. 1, folio 126 verso. Fulda Sacramentary, early eleventh century. Full-page framed illustration in two tiers: Saint Boniface performing Baptism from an opened book (upper scene) and undergoing his Martyrdom while holding a closed book as a shield (lower scene).

Image via Creative Commons Photo: Gerald Raab via http://digital.bib-bvb.de/view/bvb_mets/viewer.0.6.5.jsp?folder_id=0&dvs=1664122640293~454&pid=17786377&locale=en&usePid1=true&usePid2=true
Brocato, Linde M.

Closing Keynote Presentation

“Hybrid Books: Fragments and Compilatio, Structure and Heuristic in Richard Twiss’ Farrago”

In the group of artists’ books from the Ruth and Marvin Shackner Archive of Concrete Poetry purchased by the University of Miami Special Collections, there is an extraordinary volume, sold by a vendor as late nineteenth-century, anonymous, and an artist’s book avant la lettre. Careful analysis for bibliographical cataloging revealed the error in all these assertions.

In this presentation, I will lay out both the process of that analysis and its results, along with reflections on hybrid books of various kinds. My reflections will encompass the kinds of structured information that make their way into databases, and structuring codes of cataloging and bibliography, all of which are necessary but not sufficient for our understanding and convivencia with books, which are always already hybrid. In these reflections, I will bring together many of the strands of thinking we have all worked to weave together in the symposium.

[Figures 7–13]

Budny, Mildred (Director, Research Group on Manuscript Evidence)

“Structured Knowledge, Structures of Knowledge, and Supports for Knowledge: A Framework for the Year”

This Symposium gives cause to celebrate the many contributions to events for the RGME Year 2022 dedicated to the theme of “Structured Knowledge”. This theme, suggested and outlined by Linde M. Brocato last year, gave rise — and structure — to the pair of Spring and Autumn Symposia devoted to the paired aspects of “Structures of Knowledge” and “Supports for Knowledge”. As a framework, the theme with subdivisions or branches has provided guidelines, structures, and supports for the outgrowth, blossoming, seeds, and fruits in the series of activities. The process is similar, it seems, to the structure or armature laid onto the originally blank surface of the page for a manuscript, so as to guide and define the columns of text, lines of script, initials, display letters, ornament, illustrations, and other elements in creating a structure for communication of knowledge (and beauty) through many skills — linguistic, literate, calligraphic, artistic, sonorous, and more — developed across generations and centuries in the production, transmission, and legacy of written materials.

The materials, studies, presentations, and discussions over this year may in many ways speak for themselves, variously in the events, in their reports on the Research Group website, with Booklets in printed and digital forms, and elsewhere. The conversations also generated the themes selected for the next years: “Materials and Access” for 2023 and “Bridges” for the RGME Anniversary Year of 2024, to mark thirty-five years as an international scholarly society and twenty-five as a nonprofit educational corporation. Those themes, we may expect, would give structure and vibrance to their events.

The theme this year gives cause for reflection about the myriad sources and manifestations of Structure as it shapes, forms of Knowledge, for many moments, purposes, and functions, whether finite or unending. The continuing and timeless nature of structured knowledge, its aspirations, and its potential fulfillment (however partial or fleeting) has poignant expression in visualizations of Wisdom, or the Latin Sapientia, in her human or divine form, for example as emblem for the Book
of Wisdom in the Old Testament in illustrated manuscripts of the Bible, or the enthroned figure of Sapientia in her temple in the cycle of illustrations for the allegorical poem on the eternal battle between Vices and Virtues for the human soul in the *Psychomachia* ("War of the Soul") by the late-antique poet Aurelius Prudentius Clemens (348 – after 405, possibly circa 413). These enclosures, by means of an edifice or sanctuary for the one, and the body of the initial letter of the text for the other, endow their enthroned or standing figures with a contextual setting that is both grounded upon and arises from the import of the poet’s allegorical verses or the Biblical Book. Emblematic images of such kinds may permit or indeed encourage us to envision the possibility of a realization in human realms of practices encompassing patterns of structured knowledge, and, it may be, leading toward understanding and wisdom.

[Front Cover Image and Figures 1 and 67]

**Campbell, William H.** (Visiting Assistant Professor of History and Digital Studies and Director, Center for the Digital Text, University of Pittsburgh-Greensburg)

**McAlister, Amber** (Department of History & Architecture, University of Pittsburgh-Greensburg)

and

**Chinoy, Connor** (University of Pittsburgh-Greensburg)

*"Books in the Flesh: An Interdisciplinary Undergraduate Class with Medieval Manuscripts"

In the summer of 2022, The University of Pittsburgh-Greensburg was fortunate to be able to offer an intimate three-credit undergraduate course built around the loan of eight medieval manuscripts and one early printed Book of Hours from dealer Les Enluminures. Meeting in the Special Collections Instruction Room at Pitt’s main library, students were taught by Medieval/Renaissance scholars in History, Art History, and Literature, with additional support and instruction from Library staff.

Wherever possible, class activities revolved around direct application of our lessons on medieval culture to the examination of the manuscripts that were literally at our fingertips. Every student had a “pet manuscript” for the duration of the course and had ample opportunities to handle, examine, and study it, resulting in a series of blog posts for the Library’s website discussing the books’ interesting features. Students and faculty were also active in the Library’s Text & conText Lab, a book-arts makerspace, with activities including papermaking, typesetting, paper marbling, and hand sewing of signatures.

[Figures 14–19]

**Chandler, Katharine C.** (Special Collections and Serials Cataloger, University of Arkansas Libraries)

*"Manuscripts from Print: The Schwenkfelders and their Dangerous Books"

As one of the Catholic Church’s first measures of the Counter-Reformation, in 1563 the Council of Trent prohibited writings by certain men in particular: Martin Luther (1483–1546), Huldrych Zwingli (1484–1531), John Calvin (1509–1564), Balthasar Hubmaier (1480–1528), and Caspar Schwenckfeld von Ossig (1489 or 1490 – 1561). Schwenckfeld’s writings in his own time often circulated in manuscript for years before their printing, and printers were frequently afraid to reveal their names in Schwenckfeld’s published works, especially as he became better-known and considered heretical by both Catholics and Lutherans.


Figure 7. Pages I–II: Index; Anagrams and Musick.
Figure 8. Pages 240–24[1]. Cut-out printed extracts of various shapes, headed “Hall’s Crazy Jokes” on the verso, facing extracts on the recto which center upon a pasted-on printed image, labeled “BUTTERFLY”, enclosed in a circular cut-out, expandable, pull-out paper cage. A hand-written note, partly cropped at the edge, identifies the species as a “Brassic[a]”, or cabbage butterfly (Pieris rapae).
Figure 9. Pages 242–243: Clipped illustration and verses headed “Prank or Briole for Scolds”; and Paper Cut-outs with Landscape and Human Figures, turned sideways on the page.
Figure 10. Pages 188–189. Group of pasted elements with illustrations and printed texts: “It signifies little for Women to be young, except they be Handsom, nor Handsom, except they be young”. Some formerly pasted elements have fallen away and become lost, leaving their contours and the exposed ground of the paper support, which reveals some printed elements of its original use (“The additional weights”, “October”, “Chocolate”, etc.), apparently as a form of reused newsprint.
Figure 11. Side view of Front Cover and Fore-edge with closed clasps. Contemporary calf binding with a pair of brass clasps on white leather hinges. The surface of each clasp has incised decoration of zig-zag lines and a sprig of foliate ornament.
Figure 12 (top). Page 343. Four pasted elements, headed by the title “Labyrinth at Hampton Court”, with a cross-reference to “see p. 150”.

Figure 13 (bottom). Pages 308–309. Pair of pasted elements, accompanied by annotations in the lower margins: Front of envelope addressed by hand to “Msr. Twiss, Bush hill, Edmonton, near London, Angleterre”, with a hand-written note “Aught. 1792” in its lower right corner; and printed Ticket for one admission to the Tribune in Paris on Friday, 10 August 1792.

Figure 14. Professor and student discussing a thirteenth-century sermon book.

Figure 15. Student gingerly measuring board thickness on a fifteenth-century Italian codex.

Figure 16. On a tour of the Special Collections / Archives Preservation Lab.
Figure 17. Excitedly sharing an illuminated initial with a dragon in a thirteenth-century Psalter.

Figure 18. Examining fine details in a Book of Hours in person . . .

Figure 19. . . . and on the screen with a high-resolution camera.
Figure 20. Copper engraving by Johann Theodor de Bry (1528-1598) of Caspar Schwenckfeld of Ossing (1489-1561), in Jean Jacques Boissard, *Bibliotheca sive Thesaurus virtutis* (“Library or Treasury of Worthy Men”) (Frankfurt am Main: William Fitz, 1627), in the copy now at the Biblioteca comunale di Trento (GI 1 v. c 41). Within a niche, the bearded subject holds a closed book, with writing sheet, pen, inkwell, and tablet or plaque spread on the ledge before him. Image Public Domain: Johann Theodor de Bry, CC0, via Wikimedia Commons.
Figure 21. Title page for Caspar Schwenkfeld von Ossing, *Epistolary Des Edlen von Gott hochbegnadeten theuwen Mannes Caspar Schwenckfeldes von Ossing / seliger gedächtnis Christliche Lehrhaffte Missiuen oder Sendbrief / die er zeit seines Lebens / vom XXV. Jare an hinauff das LV. . . . geschrieben . . . Der Erste Theil* ("Epistolary of the nobleman, highly gifted by God, beloved Caspar Schwenckfeld von Ossing, in blessed memory Christian Doctrine Missives or Letters, which from the ages of twenty-five to fifty-five . . . he wrote. . . Part I" (1566); copy at Universitätsbibliothek Mainz. Published by Sigmund Feyerabend probably in Frankfurt am Main. Image Public Domain via gutenberg-capture.ub.uni-mainz-de/histbuch/periodical/structure/296349.)

Figure 22 (top left). Title Page. 
Figure 23 (bottom). Detail: Title. 
Figure 24 (top right). Vorrede ("Preface").

Figure 25 (top left). Title page with engraved architectural frame enclosing uneven hand-lettered title.

Figure 26 (bottom). Detail: Top of title.

Figure 27 (top right). First page of text, in manuscript: Den dritten sonntag im avendt ("For the Third Sunday in Advent").
und griet ist, und wie sich verlassen kan, die ist mein klug in derselben zeit, durch ihr gefall, doch all das im weiteren zeiten lopine brennen. Gott verleute sich mein kind (die seel) melch der mein kind den teib). er hat nach sin kabin, die dem elick und jud noch zuwohnen, dem sei lob und dank in zeit und ewigkeit. Amen.

demselben ist sein vaterliches berg zu zeitlebigem und ewigem zeit zum
allen bitte alle freunde herzlich zu geben, gosse sie werden mein isf nicht gar vergefelt sondern, ihrer lieb empfind.

christian hofinger

abgeschrieben von Abraham Wagner,
anno 1724, d[en]. 11 mag.
Figure 30. Venice, Basilica di Santa Maria Gloriosa dei Frari, Giovanni Bellini, Triptych of Madonna and Child with Saints Nicholas of Bari, Peter, Mark, and Benedict of Nursia (oil on panel), dated 1488. Detail of right flank: Saint Benedict with crozier and book opened at the beginning of the Old Testament Book of Ecclesiasticus. Image via Wikimedia Commons.
The Silesian Schwenkfelders, people of the book, were forced eventually to immigrate to Pennsylvania from Silesia, and they did so in six migrations — the largest in 1734. Their sea chests were filled with books: print and manuscript copies of Schwenckfeld’s writings and the writings of men in his circle. This paper will investigate the Schwenkfelders’ unusual manuscript traditions: handwritten copies of printed books, learning by copying, hymnals, and postillas — in both the traditions in Silesia from the Reformation period and those that followed after the migration to Pennsylvania. The manuscripts discussed are held in the collections of the Free Library of Philadelphia’s Rare Book Department and the Schwenkfelder Library & Heritage Center in Pennsburg, Pennsylvania.

[Figures 20–29]

Chinoy, Connor (see Campbell, William H. et al.)

Ellertson, Barbara Williams (BASIRA and Research Group on Manuscript Evidence)
“A Painter, a Printer, and a Search for Shared Exemplars”

By 1488, when Giovanni Bellini (1430–1516) completed work on what’s now known as the Frari Triptych, the “mechanical art” of printing had been a presence in Venice for almost twenty years. While we know that the prominent Pesaro family commissioned the triptych to adorn the sacristy where their mother was entombed, it is not known whether these patrons specified that the artist feature the incipit of the Book of Ecclesiasticus so prominently; Saint Benedict’s display of the open book dominates the right wing.

Since 1469, the printing trade in Venice had grown into one of the leading centers of publishing in Europe and was a source of regional pride. What exemplar might Bellini have used in modeling his painted text? In a folio Latin Bible published by Nicolas Jenson (circa 1420 – 1480) in Venice in 1476 (ISTC number ib00547000; https://data.cerl.org/istc/ib00547000), the layout of this page similarly on a verso has striking similarities to Bellini’s rendition.

This study collects images of the Ecclesiasticus incipit from an array of manuscripts and incunabula, in a close comparison of arrangements of type and layout over the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. In seeking to determine whether the Frari Triptych might embody a veiled reference to the strong Venetian tradition of printing, this search for exemplars that painters and printers might have shared explores the intersection of two transformative technologies: moveable-type printing and oil painting. How closely did early printers follow typographic patterns in manuscript models? What might we learn from works of art about the cultural context of the book during this time of technical change?

[Figure 30]

Figure 31. Collection of Hannah Goeselt. Folio 63 recto: Leaf from the Book of Judges, Chapters 4–6, with pencil annotations.
Figure 32. Northampton, Massachusetts, Smith College Museum of Art, Accession number 1950.147. Folio 131 recto: Leaf with the end of the Book of Ezra and the prologue and opening of the Book of the Prophet Tobias.
Figure 33. Lima, Ohio, Lima Public Library, *sine numero*. Folio 244 verso: Leaf with the end of the Book of Sapientia (“Wisdom”) and with the prologue and opening of the Book of the Prophet Baruch.
Figure 34. Boston, Massachusetts, Boston University School of Theology Archives, MS Leaf 37. Folio 617 verso: Leaf with part of the Book of Revelation ("Apocalypse"), Chapters 6–7, with marginal commentary and pencil annotations.

Figure 35 (top). Engraved plate of *Universitatis Bibliothec / Bibliotheca Büloviana Academiae, Georgiae Augustae donata* (1747). Image Public Domain via Wikimedia Commons.

Hannah Goeselt (Library and Information Science (MS) [or MLIS]: Cultural Heritage Informatics, Simmons University, Boston)

“Structures of Art and Scripture in Otto Ege’s ‘Cambridge Bible’ (Ege Manuscript 6)”

This brief presentation highlights some insights which emerge in the continuing investigation of the physical and textual makeup of Ege Handlist Number 6 (a “Cambridge Bible”), an English copy of the Latin Vulgate Bible dismembered and dispersed by Otto F. Ege (1888–1951). The dispersal occurred mainly in his Portfolio or leaf-book of Fifty Original Leaves (“FOL”) of Western Medieval Manuscripts: Western Europe, XII–XVI Century, but also variously by single leaves or groups of leaves. Some survivors are known, while others await recognition.

The topic will consider provenance, with an attempt to categorize the varied styles of illuminated initials within the identified remnants of the manuscript, and to mark out the systems of chapters and prefaces that make up a Bible from the first three decades of the thirteenth century.

[Figures 31–34]

Thomas E. Hill (Art Librarian, Vassar College)

“Some Early Background to Warburg’s Project in Post-Wunderkammer Systematic and Early Author-Catalogues of the European Baroque and Enlightenment Periods”

This Response provides some early background to Warburg’s project, which by all accounts is unusual in its hearkening back to post-Wunderkammer systematic and early author catalogues of the European Baroque and Enlightenment periods. Examples of models or forerunners include the catalogues designed — or aspired to — by Thomas James (circa 1573 – 1629) at the Bodleian Library in Oxford, Gottfried Wilhelm Leibniz (1646–1716) at the Hanoverian court and the Biblioteca Augusta in at Wolfenbüttel, and Johann Michael Francke (1717–1775) in Dresden.

[Figures 35–36]

Zoey Kambour (Postgraduate Fellow in European & American Art at the Jordan Schnitzler Museum of Art at the University of Oregon)

“Textual Interaction Through Artistic Expression: The Marginal Drawings in the Decretales Libri V of Pope Gregory IX (University of Oregon MS 027)”

At the RGME Spring Symposium in April, I presented research-in-progress on the marginal drawings in the copy of the Decretales of Gregory IX (Pope from 1227 to 1241 CE) at the University of Oregon (Eugene, University of Oregon Special Collections & University Archives, MS 027). The presentation examined paleographical data of the first fifty folios, described on-going research questions, and considered how these images could be discussed in an art-historical context. In those fifty folios alone, I found evidence of eight different scribal hands and at least nine different styles of manicules and bracket faces. I ended the presentation with more questions than answers, and a promise to provide an update come the Fall Symposium.

Since April, I have recorded the visual data for the entire manuscript (about 250 folios), transcribed and translated selected passages of the Decretales text, and further researched the subjects of medieval literacy, visual culture, scholastic practices, and marginal drawings. I also examined how

Figure 37 (top left). Folio 13v, within Book I: Full page with main text in two columns, surrounded by commentary.

Figure 38 (top center). Folio 113v, detail, within Book II: Capped face opposed by cuffed manicle pointing finger into the mouth.

Figure 39 (top right). Folio 183r, detail, within Book III: Face with glowering eye, chin stubble, stuck-out tongue, and leaky-faucet nose.

Figure 40 (opposite). Folio 154r, detail, within Book III: Bishop’s head with mitre topped by ripple-edged thought-bubble containing the Latin abbreviation *Xtue* for "Christus".
Figures 41–42. Manuscript supplement for the printed text. Giovanni Battista de Marinis, *Diurnum [Ritum\] Ordinis Praedicator\[um\]* “Daily Ritual for the Order of Preachers”, or Dominican Order) (Rome: Nicolai Angeli Tinassi, 1635), with an added section of liturgical prayers written in Italic Script.

Figure 41 (left). Opening page of the *Diurnum*. Figure 42 (right). Opening page of the manuscript supplement.

Figure 43 (left). Title page for the volume.

Figure 44 (right). Opening page of manuscript supplement in Latin on added, unnumbered leaves at the back, with lines of cursive script in brown ink entered between a rectangular frame outlined in single lines in similar ink. *Lytania de SS. Patronis* (“Litany for the Most Holy Protectors”), beginning with the *Kyrie Eleison* and extending to Saint *Benedicte* and then Saint *Bernarde*, namely Saint Bernard of Clairveaux (1090–1153).

Figure 45 (top left). Frontispiece title page.

Figure 46 (top right). Page 281 with rectangular patch.

Figure 47 (opposite, top). Pages 196–197 with facing patches.

Figure 48 (opposite, bottom). Pages 292–293 with facing patches.
VENERABILIS
BEDA PRES-
BYTERI,
ECCLESIASTICAE
HISTORIAE GENTIS
ANGLORVM,
LIBRI V.
VM INDICE, QVI MA-
TERIAS INFERNIRES ORDINE LITERARUM
PER LIBRES & CAPITA DE-
MONSTRAS.

COLONIAE AGrippinae,
Officina Birkmannica lumpi-
bus Arnoldi Mylius.
M. DCVII

EPITAPHIVM
de eodem.

Beda Dei famulis monachorum na-
bile frutus
Frutibus et terra, profuit Ecclesiae
Soles ille partum scrutando per omniam sa-
num,
Eloquio viguit, plurima composuit.
Annos in hac vita tesser duxit vita trivi-
ta,
Preposito officio, virili ingenio.
Iunij episcopus sedatae curae Kalendis,
Anglicana Angelicam somnium patria-
tiam.

Obiit anno ab incarnatione septen-
tefimo tricesimo quinto, ab obitu ve-
ró beati Gregorii Papa cen-
tefimo vicetimo se-
ptimo.

Et cetera verba instructae sunt
vulgo demonstratis
non habet vitam
sed hoc suum multa
veneri: id Decem. 1691

NOL DE PATRIS HABAT BEDA, quod de EREPTICIS ADIETI, antiquis
Hibernica, et Walliae.
Figure 51 (opposite, bottom left). Folio Z.3 verso. The text of Bede’s Epitaph in Latin verse, accompanied by a hand-written note in Irish and Latin, with place and date: “Winchester, on the Ides [the 13th] of December 1891”.

Figure 52 (opposite, bottom right). Series of notes on originally blank page, headed by the owner’s initials N. M. for Norman Moore (1847–1922), British physician, historian, and student of ancient manuscripts. The notes in Latin add observations about Bede’s text, including its mention (in Book III, Chapter 4) of Colum cille on “p 94”, or Columba (521–597), and its omission of Patrick (active fifth century) and other early saints of Ireland and Wales.

Figure 53 (above). Annotations on originally blank leaves at the front, with notes, sketches, and a plan of the ruins of the Ecclesia Lindisfarennis, the Norman Church (built about 1150) of Lindisfarne Priory, Lindisfarne, Northumberland.
Figures 54–55. Cover of the original pigskin blind-stamped binding with a companion pair of half-length portraits of Reformation luminaries on the front and back covers. Inside a rectangular border of frieze-like fleur-de-lys ornament, each figure appears with book in hand within an arcade above a ledge-like band formed by a three-line inscription in monumental Capitals.

Figure 54 (opposite). Front cover: Portrait of Martin Luther (1483–1546).

Figure 55 (above). Back cover: Portrait of Philip Melanchthon (1497–1560).
Figure 56 (left). Title page with Saurus’ printer’s device, book-stamp of the owner “F. Pfeiffer”, and annotations.

Figure 57 (right). Original leaf opening the *Index Vocabulorum* (*Index of Words*), with backlighting to reveal features of the material: Made of laid paper, with chainlines and surface ridges.
Figure 58 (left). Unnumbered page on added leaf with notes in German and Latin about “The Punic Nephew in Plautus’ Poenulus, Act V, Scene 1”, with reference to “Dr. Bellermann”, namely Johann Joachim Bellerman (1754 –1842), about the speeches in the Punic language by Hanno, a Carthaginian.

Figure 59 (right). Same leaf, with backlighting: Made of uniform wove paper.
Figure 60. At the University of Waterloo, M. A. student Michelle Serrano uses touch-screen technology to annotate a medieval Latin document in DRAGEN Lab.
individual marginal drawings enhance, ridicule, or add nothing at all to the original Decretales text. The research leads me to argue that the density of marginal drawings in this copy of the Decretales of Gregory IX demonstrates that an accessible method of textual interaction for medieval students was through artistic expression, despite their lack of formal artistic training.

[Figures 37–40]

Jennifer Larson (Department of Classics, Kent State University)
“Printed and Scribed: A Collector’s View of Hybrid Books”

To impose a classification scheme upon the vast array of possibilities within the category of “hybrid book” is very difficult and perhaps not necessary. Yet as a heuristic tool, classification helps us to think about the ways people interact with their books. Some of these modes of interaction have persisted nearly unchanged. Publishers still issue pocket diaries with printed content and space for the customer to fill in, and many readers add marginalia, just as they have since the invention of the book. Yet other modes of interaction have mostly disappeared. Interleaving, for example, used to be a standard method by which book owners expanded the space available for translations, compositions or comments on a text.

Examples of early printed books from my collection and from booksellers’ offerings show that seventeenth- and eighteenth-century owners readily changed the interior structure of books as issued. Repairs by owners were common, as in a 1632 copy of Jeremias Drexel’s De aeternitate considerationes, in which missing text (according to the owner’s best guess) has been handwritten on numerous pieces of paper pasted in.

Hybridization also reveals the history of individual copies. A copy of 1604 of the comedies of Plautus, for example, continued to be used as a scholarly aid two hundred years after its publication, when an early nineteenth-century owner tipped in a section of handwritten notes. Liturgical works offer especially interesting and beautiful examples of augmentation, as in the cases of a 1686 Rule of St. Benedict and a 1655 Dominican diurnum which have been supplemented with manuscript prayers specialized for the time and place. These instances of combining printed and manuscript components highlight the functionality of books as aids in the owners’ and users’ work.

[Figures 41–59]

McAlister, Amber (see Campbell, William H. et al.)
Figure 61. New York, Morgan Library & Museum, MS M. 939, folio 1 recto, detail. León, Spain, 1181. Opening initial P for *Principia* ("Principles") in the *Glossa in Epistolae Beati Pauli* ("Gloss or Commentary on the Epistles of Paul") by Peter Lombard (circa 1096 – 1160). Within the initial, a parchment-maker bends works at a table on blank sheets of parchment.
McCarthy, Caley (Research Associate and Project Manager, Environments of Change, University of Waterloo)

and

Moore, Andrew (Research Fellow, Environments of Change, and Associate Director, DRAGEN Lab, University of Waterloo)

“Collaborative Pedagogy with Medieval Manuscripts in a Digital Lab”

Collaborative learning is an essential part of how we train students in the Digital Research Arts for Graphical and Environmental Networks (DRAGEN) Lab at the University of Waterloo. Our scaffolded approach brings together undergraduates, graduate students, and professors in the same space.

By working together in a collegial environment, learners of all levels interact with teachers of many different skillsets. For example, during workshops on digitization of medieval manuscripts and medieval Latin paleography, more experienced practitioners helped elevate the learning outcomes of those new to the practice. We ask each group of students to choose a document that differs from other groups in the type of record, the hand, and even sometimes the era and language. This has included medieval Latin book hands, manorial court rolls, account books, criminal inquests, and notarial registers from England and Provence, a fifteenth-century French hunting manual, and seventeenth-century English legal proceedings. Students then transcribe and translate the document and present to their peers overviews of the document’s writing style, terminology, and context.

Resources in our lab, including cutting-edge digital technology, provide valuable tools for this pedagogical process. We have a range of original medieval manuscripts and facsimiles, which facilitate hands-on learning for our students. The texture of each vellum document, for example, is not only experienced physically by each paleographer, but is also brought into sharp focus by mobile microscopes that allow users to magnify details right up to the follicle. Such tools, which can include UV light, also assist in reading damaged or faded text. The presentation of documents and specific text then casts onto our state-of-art 87” touchscreen computer, which allows for in-depth analysis by entire groups of people. These resources, combined with our collaborative approach, provide an exciting new avenue for pedagogical paleography.

[Figure 60]

Moore, Andrew (see McCarthy, Caley, and Moore, Andrew)

Porreca, David (Department of Classics, University of Waterloo)

“My $0.02 Worth”

This brief response is designed to offer observations about the presentations and their subjects, and to lead into the Q&A.
Figure 62 (top). London, Woburn Square, Warburg Institute. Exterior viewed from the northwest. Designed by the firm of Charles Holden (1875–1960) as part of the University of London (since 1944), the building was completed in 1958. Photograph by Philafrenzy (2 June 2015) via Creative Commons.

Figure 63 (bottom). Former location of the Kulturwissenschaftliche Bibliothek Warburg (“Warburg Library of Cultural Studies”) at 116 Heilwigstraße, Hamburg. Front of the building, constructed in 1925–1926 and opened ceremonially in 1926, to mark the transition from a private scholar’s library to a (semi-) public library. Photograph by Ajepbah (27 June 2011) via Creative Commons.
Porreca, David

“The Warburg Institute Library: Where Idiosyncracy Meets User-Friendliness”

The Warburg Institute’s Library began to be constituted over a century ago, and has been in continuous development and refinement ever since. The collection, which grew from a core brought to London in 1933/1944 from the Kulturewissenschaft Bibliothek Warburg in Hamburg, describes itself on its website as focusing upon “the afterlife of antiquity and the survival and transmission of culture, with a particular emphasis on Medieval and Renaissance”. It features an idiosyncratic division and organization of materials into four conceptual categories — Image, Word, Orientation, Action — inspired by the vision of its founder, Aby Warburg (1866–1929).

This presentation will offer a brief summary of the history of the Institute and its collection of printed materials (I will leave to others to discuss its photographic collection, which lies beyond the purview of both my experience as a user and my expertise as a scholar), followed by a discussion of the principles and ideas behind its unique layout. The plan is also to share my personal experience in attempting to replicate usefully the structure of the library within my own collection of books.

[Figures 62–63]

Savage, Jessica L. (Art History Specialist, Index of Medieval Art)

“Cataloguing Manuscript Iconography between Digital Covers at the Index of Medieval Art”

The cataloguing side of the Index of Medieval Art database (https://theindex.princeton.edu/) is divided into three top-level categories designed to handle the creation of records for Monuments and their in-situ iconography, various Works of Art Types for three-dimensional art objects, and Manuscripts. At the heart of this cataloguing work is the careful examination of medieval iconography as it is analyzed, described, and linked on records within the Index database.

This paper will examine the schema employed by the Index to create database records for manuscripts, including decorated codices, leaf fragments, and scrolls. Each illumination, each miniature, initial, and margin provides an opportunity for the cataloguer to bring to light the intricate painted details and subject matter of the manuscript. Common themes for manuscript cataloguing work at the Index include the description and organization of major and minor decoration on the page, as well as the challenge of cataloguing ornament, recording complex inscriptions and text/image relationships, and assigning subjects to rich and extensive thematic content, from new narrative scenes to drolleries in borders.

By framing these ideas with live searches of the Index database, this paper will also introduce the technical aspects of manuscript cataloguing work. This will broadly be covered with three core concepts:

1) coverage, or what types of manuscripts, liturgical and narrative, are entered into the Index database and what fields capture this content;

2) structure, or what is the digital arrangement of manuscript records and how do we assess these parts; and

3) standards, or what are some of the approaches that cataloguers take to create codicological keywords and browsable headings.
Figures 64–66. Private collection, Jain Manuscript on paper, with watermarks and date of 1675. Śālibhadra-mahamuti-carittam (or similar), apparently a variant or commentary on Śālibhadra-carita ("The Story of Śālibhadra"). Dated by colophon. Having lost its first leaf, it retains Leaves 2–42. Written in Devanāgarī script in single columns between sets of vertical bounding lines, the positioning of script at the center of some columns, with with staggered gaps, emulates orientation around the location for (absent) stringing holes. Photography by David W. Sorenson.


Figure 65 (top left). Leaf 2 recto. After the missing first leaf, this leaf now opens the manuscript.

Figure 66 (bottom left). Leaf 42 verso. Colophon, with the title of the work (line 4), and the date of its copy (line 5).
Acknowledging a long legacy of manuscript cataloguing at the Index, this paper will also briefly address the foundational holdings of the “Illuminated Manuscript” category in the physical archive, as well as the scope of the manuscript legacy data before it migrated to the Index’s new database platform in 2017.

[Figure 61]

Sorenson, David W. (Allan Berman, Numismatist)
“A Jain MS of the Seventeenth Century on Imported Watermarked Paper”

Indian manuscripts on watermarked paper before the nineteenth century are very unusual; those that are found are usually imported from the Levant. Here we present a Jain manuscript in single-fold format — that is, the entire manuscript comprises a single quire folded in the middle, or it was before someone cut it apart — with remains of stringing-hole spaces, from the late-seventeenth century. The manuscript comprises forty-two leaves, but the first leaf is missing, so its folios number 2–42. It has a dated colophon, for VS (Vikram Samvat) 1731 = 1675 CE, and watermarks typical of the period.

Written in Devanāgarī Script, the text, entitled Śālibhadra-mahamuti-carittam (or similar), is apparently a variant or commentary on the well-known Jain work Śālibhadra-caupaī or Śālibhadra-carita (“The Story of Śālibhadra”), the tale of the Jain convert Śalibhadra. This copy was once part of a collection volume, hence two sets of page numbers.

The watermarks are very fragmentary, as the paper was trimmed to a particular size, but their general motifs are clear: an ornate Italian lily, a crown, a coat of arms, and a star and inverted crescent. None of these is easy to find in Heawood, especially in multiple PDF format; but, then, nothing is easy to find in Heawood. The case of this dated manuscript, with watermarks, might indicate earlier importation of paper stocks for the production of Indian manuscripts than customarily recognized.


[Figures 64–66]

Yavuz, N. Kıvılcım (Lecturer in Medieval Studies and Digital Humanities, School of History, University of Leeds)
“Bound With: Towards a Typology of Hybrid Codices”

The response considers the decision-making processes involved in producing codices composed of handwritten and printed components and proposes ways of differentiating among different types of hybrid codices.
Founded in 1989 in England as an international scholarly organization, and incorporated in 1999 in the United States as a nonprofit educational corporation, the Research Group on Manuscript Evidence exists to apply an integrated approach to the study of manuscripts and other forms of the written or inscribed word, in their transmission across time and space.

Information about the activities and publications of the Research Group appears on the official website: http://manuscriptevidence.org/wpme. The website is designed and maintained by our WebMaster, Jesse Hurlbut. Like our website, our Booklets are edited by our Director, Mildred Budny. Our multilingual digital font, Bembino, is freely available: http://manuscriptevidence.org/wpme/bembino.

The Research Group welcomes donations for its nonprofit educational mission, including donations in kind, expertise, advice, and contributions to our work, research, scholarly events, exhibitions, and publications. They are easy to send via http://manuscriptevidence.org/wpme/contributions-and-donations.

We invite you to subscribe (via http://eepurl.com/6JMcD) to our mailing list, for our Newsletter, and for information about our activities. Please contact director@manuscriptevidence.org with your questions, suggestions, and contributions.