



A Colloquium of the RESEARCH GROUP ON MANUSCRIPT EVIDENCE

www.manuscriptevidence.org/wpme/

Friday, 14 November 2014

106 McCormick Hall, Princeton University

When the Dust Has Settled

Or, When Good Scholars Go Back . . .

**Colloquium Co-Sponsored by
The Index of Christian Art at Princeton University**

**SESSIONS 1:15–5:30pm
106 McCormick Hall**

**RECEPTION 5:30–7:00pm
Index of Christian Art**

Sponsors: Department of Art & Archaeology,
Princeton University
John H. Rassweiler
Celia Chazelle

What happens when a dedicated specialist returns to a subject of long-term interest after other tasks — other projects, jobs, administrative tasks, life in general — have cleared away? While the world, methods, tools, and aims of research (let alone publication) have changed dramatically, sometimes beyond recognition, a return to the chosen subject might also draw upon experience and reflection gained through the passage of time, an accumulation of experiences, and extended “immersion” both in the subject matter and its wider contexts. Thus, although daunting, the return need not involve a start completely from Square One or Ground Zero.

When the dust has settled, and, it may be, the air has cleared, a return might allow for renewal, which could build upon an available, partly remembered, foundation for direction and refinement in this light. Our colloquium offers informal reflections, questions, and discussions about the challenges and potential of returning now to a variety of subjects, in the arts and letters, from Antiquity to Modernity.

The new exhibition at the Index of Christian Art, with selected materials from the archives of its founder Charles Rufus Morey, forms a centerpiece for reflections about the gathering of cumulative resources. We celebrate the anniversaries of the Research Group on Manuscript Evidence this year (25 years as an international scholarly society and 15 years as a nonprofit educational corporation) and the long-term co-sponsorship for the Research Group’s scholarly meetings by the Index and other Departments and Programs of the University.

Program

SESSION 1:15–3:00pm

McCormick 106

Introduction and Welcome

Mildred Budny

(Research Group on Manuscript Evidence)

Session 1. Back to the Middle

Moderator: **Catherine Fernandez** (Index of Christian Art)

Richard K. Emmerson (Manhattan College)

“Approaching the Apocalypse Yet Again”

Herbert Broderick (Lehman College, City University of New York)

“Me and the Man of La Mancha: Pursuing the Impossible Dream (Considering Moses in the Illustrated Old English Hexateuch)”

Mildred Budny (Research Group on Manuscript Evidence)

“Still Tied Up in Knotwork: Interlace Ornament and the Royal Bible Master”

COFFEE BREAK 3:00–3:30pm

Lobby outside McCormick 106

SESSION 3:30–5:00pm

McCormick 106

Session 2. Back Again

Moderator: **Henry Schilb** (Index of Christian Art)

Judith Oliver (Colgate University Emerita)

“Rethinking Haseloff: The ‘Schools’ of Flemish Psalter Illustration in Their Mercantile Context”

Tom Jacoby (Research Group on Manuscript and Other Evidence)

“Qal’at Sim’an and Deir Sim’an 40 Years Later”

Michael T. Davis (Princeton Theological Seminary and Rider University)

“Fast Forward: Manuscripts Ancient and Modern, with Views of Ezra Pound and His Editor”

DISCUSSION 5:00–5:30pm

Moderator: **Celia Chazelle** (The College of New Jersey)

RECEPTION 5:30–7:00pm

Index of Christian Art

with visit to the Exhibition guided by **Judith Golden**

Abstracts (Alphabetical order by Speaker)

Broderick, Herbert (Lehman College, City University of New York)

“Me and the Man of La Mancha: Pursuing the Impossible Dream (Considering Moses in the Illustrated Old English Hexateuch)”

As a graduate student at Columbia University ca. 1972, I wrote to the art historian C.R. Dodwell to inquire about the possibility of writing a Ph.D. thesis on London, British Library, Cotton MS Claudius B.iv, the so-called “Illustrated Old English Hexateuch.” Lo, some 43 years later, I am editing the manuscript of my book on the representation of Moses in Claudius B.iv, with the working title *Moses the Egyptian in the Illustrated Old English Hexateuch*, to be published by University of Notre Dame Press. Let us say, at this point in time, that a few things happened in the interim — among them, the Vietnam War; teaching Middle-School Art for 3 years; returning to graduate school; completing a Ph.D. on another Old English manuscript with Old Testament Biblical illustrations (Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Junius 11); and teaching at Lehman College of the City University of New York for the past 36 years, with 5½ of them as Chair of a Studio Art Department.

Off and on for the past 20 years or so, I have pursued the various ramifications of the representation of Moses in Claudius B.iv, which contains a “paraphrase” in Old English of the first six books of the Bible with over 400 illustrations, thought to have been produced at St. Augustine’s, Canterbury, at some time in the second quarter of the 11th century. In its illustrations, Moses appears an astonishing 127 times, with 8 distinctive attributes, among them the first extant example of Moses with horns.

Contrary to Dodwell’s assessment in his introduction to the 1974 *Early English Manuscripts in Facsimile Series* publication of Claudius B.iv that the majority of its illustrations were directly inspired by its Old English text, I hope to demonstrate that all of the distinctive attributes of Moses in this extraordinary manuscript derive instead from an originally Hellenistic Egyptian Jewish literary apologetic, adopted by Early Christian writers such as Clement of Alexandria and Eusebius of Caesarea, that presented Moses as a Hellenistic military general, High Priest, prophet, and scribe. These 8 distinctive features represent the largest number of visual attributes given to Moses in the entire corpus of Early Christian, Medieval, and Renaissance art. Thanks to the marvels of the digital age, and the generosity of the British Library, the entire manuscript is available in high-quality images online for all to enjoy.

Budny, Mildred (Research Group on Manuscript Evidence, Princeton)

“Still Tied Up in Knotwork: Interlace Ornament and the Royal Bible Master”

Interlace ornament belongs among the myriad forms of geometric and other ornamental patterns which occur around the world in many cultures across the millennia, with some significant variations or manifestations specific to their times and places. It turns up anywhere, and more-or-less everywhere. Some of the manifestations are capable of transfer from one cultural setting to another widely distant in time or space. For example, the compelling early-medieval ‘Insular’ manifestations (that is, pertaining to the British Isles), drawing upon Mediterranean and other models, have found favor in the so-called ‘Celtic’ Revival of 19th-century Irish, Scottish, and other resurgences, as well as among subsequent developments in many forms of artistic expression nowadays (tattoos included).

My long-term study of interlace ornament as a research subject began with its expertly inventive specimens in the large-format 9th-century Royal Bible of St. Augustine's Abbey, Canterbury, the manuscript subject of my **Ph.D. dissertation** (University of London, 1987). Then, between other tasks (scholarly, administrative, and more), the study extended to other manuscripts and other media (*Illustrated Catalogue* (1997), etc.), reported some of the cumulative results for the Index of Christian Art conference "*From Ireland Coming*" and its publication (2001), and broadened the reach for an **invited lecture** (2012), which continues to attract feedback.

Now the process of study returns to consider an updated view, taking into account contributions in an appropriately, but dauntingly, wide range of fields, including art history, archaeology, literary studies, graphic arts, and knot theory in mathematics — as well as the factor entailed in internet access to more and more sources, both among the original materials and the accounts or appropriations thereof. Here is a case where long-term (albeit part-time) and wide experience, drawing upon many interconnected (or interlaced) subjects, can indeed come in handy. That it is still tied up in the knotwork, with more challenges, obstacles, and opportunities emerging (with loose ends and interlinks alike), may correspond suitably to the subject itself. That the 'guidance' of the Royal Bible Master's outstanding achievement, for example as a 'mystery' itself to investigate, has been serendipitously valuable throughout this exploration is a bonus.

Davis, Michael T. (Princeton Theological Seminary and Rider University)

"Fast Forward: Manuscripts Ancient and Modern"

Though currently working in material from the Near East during Late Antiquity, I was pleasantly surprised that a publisher had decided to take a virtually completed book project of mine and a colleague, Cameron McWhirter, of *The Wall Street Journal*. The book is *Ezra Pound and Globe Magazine—The Complete Correspondence*. It will not only include an edition of the letters between Pound and James Taylor Dunn, the young editor of the fledgling travel journal *Globe*. The articles that Pound wrote for the journal will also appear.

Obviously, this turn of events led me from the ancient and to reengage with modernist manuscript materials. Therefore, the presentation will deal with how the editing and interpretation of 20th-century modernist correspondence presents both similar and different challenges when compared to that of ancient or medieval manuscript materials.

Emmerson, Richard K. (Professor of Art History and English and Dean Emeritus, Manhattan College)

"Approaching the Apocalypse Yet Again"

For more than twenty years, since editing with Bernard McGinn our volume on *The Apocalypse in the Middle Ages* (Cornell, 1993), I have been saying that someone should write a book surveying the rich and vast tradition of medieval illuminated Apocalypse manuscripts. Two factors have kept me from attempting such a project: first, I am not an art historian; and second, administrative duties as Director of the Medieval Academy of America, as Department Chair, and as Dean have allowed precious little time to undertake in-depth research and extensive writing.

Now that the dust has settled (I have retired from the joys of being a dean), I no longer have the second excuse. And since I know of no art historian taking on this large project, I have decided to do so, vigorously and happily conducting research at the Morgan Library and other research venues since July. I have discovered that much has been published on Apocalypse manuscripts and medieval apocalypticism in the past twenty years — some very impressive and some quite disappointing — yet much remains to be done. I'm pleased that a university press is interested in my proposed book on illustrated Apocalypses, a project still being shaped that I will describe as my contribution to this colloquium.

Jacoby, Thomas (Research Group on Manuscript and Other Evidence, Princeton)

“Qal’at Sim’an and Deir Sim’an 40 Years Later”

As an Art History graduate student at UCLA, I worked in several libraries on campus, and received an MA in Medieval Art History. Then as an ABD (“All But Dissertation”) student I taught full-time as a leave-of-absence-replacement and as a visiting lecturer at several institutions in California.

In 1975 I spent several months photographing Early Christian churches in Syria and the Levant, with a concentration especially on the churches of the limestone massif in Northwest Syria. Seeing few opportunities in teaching full-time, especially with my subject concentration, and unexpectedly needing to find a replacement director for my dissertation, I returned to Academic librarianship (an earlier degree) full-time, first at SUNY Binghamton as the Head of the Fine Arts Library and then as Head of the Art & Design Library and Medieval Studies bibliographer, among other subject areas, at the University of Connecticut at Storrs, until I retired in 2002.

The Harvard University Fine Arts Library, Historic Photographs Collection, heard about my photographs and purchased them. After I cataloged the collection, Harvard processed the collection for scholarly use (see *Hollis*, the Harvard online library catalog, under my full name). The Visual Resources Collection in the Department of Art and Archaeology of Princeton University is now in the process of digitizing the collection. Besides Harvard, there are several hundred of my images in the Dumbarton Oaks Research Library in Washington.

Two years ago, I resumed my investigation of Syrian Churches, especially the little-known building complexes at Qal’at Sim’an and Deir Sim’an in the Limestone massif. The bibliography on Late Antiquity has grown enormously since I last worked on the monuments and I am now trying to come to grips with the bibliography that has been sparked by the recent increase of interest in Late Antiquity, notably here at Princeton.

Showing a map of Syria and a few images of the building complex to acquaint you with the site, since it is so little known, I will briefly discuss several problems I have encountered in resuming my research, including a mystery or two. The sites I will discuss, like many others in Syria nowadays, may suffer extensive losses, but at this writing they have mostly been spared. Such changes render more poignant the documentation which the 1975 photographs provide.

Oliver, Judith (Professor of Art and Art History and Medieval & Renaissance Studies Emerita, Colgate University)

“Rethinking Haseloff: The ‘Schools’ of Flemish Psalter Illustration in Their Mercantile Context”

In 1938 Günther Haseloff’s thesis on psalter illustration in northern Europe (excluding Germany) first laid out the rich variety of iconographic cycles employed to highlight the 8 to 10 liturgical divisions of 13th-century Gothic psalters. He divided manuscripts from the Flemish region into three schools distinguished by very distinctive and differing cycles of images: prophets in Bruges, saints in Saint Omer, and the life of Christ in Ghent, though in reality his schools are quite tentative, as only a minority of manuscripts in his groups are localized to the town in question.

Nearly a century later, it is obviously high time to “redo” Haseloff’s corpus by adding the hundreds of additional psalters now known to scholars and adding Germany to the overall study. A more modest and focused undertaking entails rethinking the three so-called Flemish schools. As Kerstin Carlvart’s recent book (2013) demonstrates, the historiated initials often belong to larger two-page spreads, which bring together the themes Haseloff segregated into distinct schools. These “schools” were also not geographically distinct, but were instead iconographic alternatives available in the specialized workshops located in Bruges and Ghent.

What remains largely unexamined is why these diverse cycles of images were created, contrasting as they do with the nearly universal French literal illustrations which also infiltrated into many Flemish psalters. One needs to look more closely at the ownership of these books by prosperous merchants, bankers, and city officials and particularly at the involvement of their clerical advisors, the mendicant friars firmly established in Flemish cities. Obsessed with the sin of usury, the friars preached frequently against the very mercantile culture making these towns so prosperous and populous.

My investigation of these cycles begins with a consideration of sermons preached by mendicant friars in northern Europe to specific social classes and on specific themes related to usury. (What sermons were actually preached in Flanders is uncertain and requires further research.) The theme of preaching itself is the focus of a substantial percentage of scenes illustrated in the psalters. The Christological scenes selected are limited in range with the looming judgment to come a constant theme. How they interrelate with images of saints on facing pages requires closer scrutiny. I would argue that the saints depicted served as visual exempla designed to keep the importance of charity immediately present to the books’ readers and it is this aspect of the larger topic which will form the focus of my paper.





Selections from the archives of Charles Rufus Morey at the Index of Christian Art on exhibition until the end of November 2014. Glimpsed here are photographs, postcards, printing proofs, an inscribed dedication copy, and a portrait of Morey found among his correspondence.

The Research Group exists to apply an integrated approach to the study of manuscripts and other forms of the written or inscribed word, in their transmission across time and space.

Information about the activities and publications of the Research Group on Manuscript Evidence appears on its official website: <http://manuscriptevidence.org/wpme/>. The Research Group welcomes donations for its nonprofit educational mission, including donations in kind, expertise, advice, and contributions to our work, research, scholarly events, exhibitions, and publications.

Please subscribe (via <http://eepurl.com/6JMcd>) to our mailing list, for our newsletter and information about our activities. Please contact director@manuscriptevidence.org with your questions, suggestions, and contributions.

Exhibition Notes



The Index of Christian Art is pleased to present the exhibition of “*Collected Items and Educational Pursuits of Charles Rufus Morey (1877–1955), Founder of the Index of Christian Art*” — its first presentation of archival materials. When the Index was founded ninety-seven years ago, the accumulated descriptions of works of art and research photographs were housed in simple cardboard shoeboxes. Morey’s guidance kept a visionary, and revisionary, hold over the Index for nearly the next two decades, which in turn produced the integral card catalogue, still in use today. In his lifetime, Morey saw his work blossom into arguably the greatest undertaking of the iconographic classification of medieval art.

As a Cultural Attaché in Rome, as founding member of the College Art Association, and diligent educator, speaker, and author, Morey’s contributions made a permanent impact on this organization’s history. The Index holds a small portion of his personal and professional papers and inscribed books; more of them are permanently housed in the University archives. The aim of this exhibition is to bring to light some of these in-house, historical papers associated with the scholarly pursuits of the Index’s founder.

Some exhibition highlights include the dedication copy of *The Art Bulletin* (Vol. XXXII/4, December 1950), which was specially issued, bound, and inscribed to Morey by his former students, including Kurt Weitzmann and Erwin Panofsky. The overlapping careers of these three art historians have left an indelible mark on medieval art–history scholarship centered at Princeton. The Index holds Morey’s proof copy of his ground-breaking book, co-authored with Leslie Webber-Jones: *Early Christian Art: An Outline of the Evolution of Style and Iconography in Sculpture and Painting from Antiquity to the Eighth Century*, published by Princeton University Press in 1942. Morey’s mock copy, “for printer,” arranges the plates for his book on *The Miniatures of the Manuscripts of Terence*, published for the Department of Art and Archaeology of Princeton University in 1930–1931. The final version of the book has 796 plates and remains an authority on Terence studies. On display too is a biographical memoir reprinted from the *Year Book of the American Philosophical Society* (1955), inscribed, signed, and dated by Panofsky to Sara Morey, wife of Charles: “To Sarah (*sic*) in memory of one who will never be forgotten! Pan May 22, 1956.” Included also are rare photographs of Morey with students on the Princeton campus and with colleagues on trips in Italy, as well as, some very early 20th century thumbnail research photographs of Roman architecture. To enhance the personal aspect of the ensemble, a pen and ink contour drawing of Morey, presumably executed by a student or colleague, is on display. The portrait was found folded among Morey’s correspondence and is a charming addition.

The gathering of these materials in the archive is, in a sense, “unintentional”, so that the collection seems “organic”, as opposed to a conscious effort to publicize or disseminate his papers. Morey’s records preserve clear traces of his contributions. Their value is contained in that miscellany, which attests to a career well packed with ideas and achievements. Indeed, we recognize that by reflecting on the cumulative history of the Index we can be inspired with fresh vision for another hundred years and beyond.

This selection of the archive will be on view in the lobby of the Index of Christian Art until the end of November.